

# Report of the Director of Place to the meeting of Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee to be held on 9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

**AI**

---

## **Subject:**

Response to the Hate Crime Scrutiny Review

## **Summary statement:**

Led by the Stronger Communities Service, this report provides a detailed multi-agency response to the recommendations and findings to the Hate Crime Scrutiny Review.

## **EQUALITY & DIVERSITY:**

The delivery of Hate Crime work contributes to all four of the Council's Equality Objectives:

- Visibility, leadership and accountability;
- Workforce;
- Community; and
- Services.

---

Noreen Akhtar  
Assistant Director, Department of Place

### **Portfolio:**

Neighbourhoods & Community Safety

Report Contact: Neena Punnu  
Phone: 07582 109 834  
E-mail: [neena.punnu@bradford.gov.uk](mailto:neena.punnu@bradford.gov.uk)

### **Overview & Scrutiny Area:**

Corporate

## 1. SUMMARY

- 1.1 The Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee undertook an in-depth scrutiny review, into the effectiveness of Bradford Council and its partners in addressing Hate Crime across the Bradford District. The Hate Crime Scrutiny Review and recommendations report was published in Mar-21. **See Appendix A.**
- 1.2 This report provides a detailed response to the recommendations in the Hate Crime Scrutiny Review. It highlights the Hate Crime work undertaken mainly (but not limited to) between Apr-21 to Dec-22. A clear Hate Crime Delivery Plan with milestones has also been produced which illustrates key work areas and the progress that is being made to support the delivery of the Hate Crime Strategy. The Delivery Plan now creates alignment of Hate Crime work amongst key agencies. See **Appendix B** Hate Crime Strategy and **Appendix C** Hate Crime Delivery Plan (Draft)

## 2. BACKGROUND

### 2.1 Definition of a Hate Crime and Hate Incident

- 2.1.1 **Hate Crime** – “Any criminal offence which is perceived by the victim or any other person, to be motivated by hostility or prejudice, based on a person's disability or perceived disability; race or perceived race; or religion or perceived religion; or sexual orientation or perceived sexual orientation or transgender identity or perceived transgender identity.” (Crown Prosecution Service & Police Force)
- 2.1.2 **Perception** – Perception is the way we understand something or make sense of it. So, if you believe that you have been targeted because of who you are, or you witness something that you believe is motivated by hostility toward someone specifically because of who they are, then that could be a Hate Crime. Alternatively, it can also be the perpetrator's perception of another individual. If a perpetrator sees someone and makes an assumption about their race or sexuality based on first impression, clothing, or who they are with for example, whether that assumption is correct or not, and attacks them based on that assumption, then this could also be a Hate Crime.
- 2.1.3 **Hate Incident** - A non-crime (i.e. anything that is not a criminal offence). See [Understanding Hate Crime or Hate Incident](#)

### 2.2 Delivery of Hate Crime work

- 2.2.1 **Bradford Council:** Following the cessation of funding for the Community Coordinator at Bradford Council, in Apr-22 the work of Hate Crime is now overseen by the Stronger Communities Service at the Council, Department of Place. From Sept-22 the Partnerships and Engagement Manager leads on the Hate Crime work for the local authority, supported by a new team of five Partnership & Engagement Officers who help deliver the actions within the Hate Crime Strategy - all working together to build on **Safe, Strong and Active Communities**, championing equality, diversity and inclusion.

**2.2.2 Bradford Hate Crime Alliance (BHCA)** is funded through the Safer Communities Partnership and reports on a quarterly basis through the Hate Crime Strategic Group chaired by the Stronger Communities Partnerships and Engagement Manager. The team at BHCA is made up of Hate Crime Director and Hate Crime Coordinator who works 22 hours a week. BHCA attends the Safer Communities Partnership on an annual basis to report back on the progress made on Hate Crime work and also attends the Stronger Communities Partnership Board on a quarterly basis.

**2.2.3 West Yorkshire Police** has dedicated Hate Crime Officers within the Stronger Communities Police Team, reporting to the Stronger Communities and Partnerships Inspector. The Police team includes a Sergeant and two Hate Crime Coordinators; supported by the five Police Engagement Officers who lead on Tension Monitoring; Women’s Engagement; Emerging Communities; Youth Engagement and Faith Engagement. The Police and Council teams are co-located. The Police Hate Crime Coordinators work together with BHCA, Victim Support and Restorative Solutions every Tuesday at the BHCA site.

### 2.3 Overview of Reported Hate Crime Data

**Table 1** shows the annual hate incidents 2016-22 – West Yorkshire Police

Year	All Hate	Race	Faith	Disability	Sexual Orientation	Trans-gender	% increase
2016-17	1566	1258	103	71	125	31	22.1%
2017-18	1940	1434	199	151	178	31	23.9%
2018-19	2232	1628	200	205	236	38	15.1%
2019-20	2437	1766	182	226	271	52	8.4%
2020-21	2566	1952	194	203	313	31	5.3%
2021-22	2743	1997	207	251	318	60	6.9%
12m-Dec22	2756	1869	200	280	305	70	0.5%

\* The figures represent April to March periods; the last row shows 12 full months; Figures are correct at 30/01/2023, however may change if refreshed due to changes to the crime flags and hate flags.

Compared against 2021-22 Hate Incidents in Bradford for the 12 months to Dec-22 continued to see an increase as per previous years.

### 2.4 Hate Crime Scrutiny Review: Work undertaken under each recommendation

The Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee agreed in Apr-19, to undertake an in-depth Scrutiny Review, into the effectiveness of Bradford Council and its partners in addressing Hate Crime across the District. The review published a set of recommendations for improvements in tackling Hate Crime across the District, the review was published in Mar-21. **See Appendix A.**

Work undertaken under each of the recommendations from the Hate Crime Review is presented below. A detailed delivery plan has also been published which highlights key work areas under specific actions and the progress that is being made to support the delivery of the Hate Crime Strategy. See **Appendix B** Hate Crime Strategy and **Appendix C** Hate Crime Delivery Plan (Draft).

**2.5 Recommendation 1 - That in order to reduce underreporting and improve after care victim support of Hate Crime within specific groups, Bradford Council, Hate Bradford Hate Crime Alliance and the Police should undertake targeted work particularly with those groups that are known to underreport.**

**2.5.1** Common themes throughout the Scrutiny Review highlighted under reporting of Hate Crime across the District especially amongst: new and emerging communities such as Roma and travelling communities; South Asian women, with cultural barriers being a contributory factor here; and Eastern and Central European and refugee communities.

**2.5.2 NOTE:** The data given within this report which indicates a '**Target**' and update on '**Progress**' is for reporting period between **Apr-22 to Mar-23**.

**2.5.3 Hate Crime Awareness Information and Publicity Materials**

1. Published and circulated Hate Crime reporting materials: leaflets, reporting cards; keyring, pens; banners, with QR codes.  
**Target: 10,000; Progress: 36,000** distributed.
2. Radio Broadcasts & YouTube channel established – A series of difficult conversations podcasts produced from Oct-22;  
**Target: 6; Progress: 6** podcasts produced. Lived experiences are based on LGBTQ+; Roma; and Race conversations. These podcasts have been downloads 230 times.
3. 9 films have been created as part of the Listen Bradford Campaign 'We are listening'.
4. Launch of new BHCA Website in Nov-22;  
**Target: BHCA Webpage Users 1000; Progress 355;**  
**Target: BHCA Webpage hits 5000, Progress 3296.**  
Target work in 2023 is to ensure a link to the new BHCA website /reporting centres are added to the websites of other organisations.
5. Launch of new Reporting App in Oct-22;  
**Target: Web App New Users 1000; Progress: 692.**
6. Running a series of Hate Crime Roadshows and Workshops across the district: **Target: 11; Progress: 11.**
7. Active on Social Media and on websites (see 2.18.2 in this report)
8. Developing educational resources to empower and support victims of Hate Crime: work in progress focusing on; rehabilitation and reintegration; empowering victims and communities; legislation awareness; building trust; encouraging reporting; communicating of personal testimony. The work to develop these resources is in progress. See examples of Roma and other Hate Crime films produced as part of the resources.

## 2.5.4 Hate Crime Awareness Training

1. Targeted training delivered by BHCA with identified groups who are known to underreport as well as groups from protected characteristics.  
**Target: 300; Progress: 718 reached.**
2. Hate Crime Reporting Centre Unit Refresher Training;  
**Target: 4; Progress: 8** refresher training sessions delivered.
3. Restorative Solutions delivered  
Hate Crime Awareness (compulsory) courses: **Target: 20; Progress: 14;**  
and (non-compulsory) training **Target: 20; Progress: 12.**
4. Bespoke Hate Crime training is given to all new officers and staff who join the Police.

See **Appendix C** – Hate Crime Delivery Plan (Draft) – Action 2.1 (a, b & c) for detailed examples of events/activities that have been conducted with targeted groups that are known to underreport.

## 2.6 Recommendation 2 - That a programme of Hate Crime events, for all communities across the District, aimed awareness raising of the importance of reporting Hate Crime, be built into the Bradford Hate Crime Alliance contract.

**2.6.1** BHCA have delivered Hate Crime events and activities throughout 2022 and attended several other events as Keynote Speakers to raise awareness on Hate Crime. During Hate Crime Awareness Week 2022 a combination of events and activities took place. **Target: 5; Progress: 6** activities/events took place. See **Appendix C** – Hate Crime Delivery Plan (Draft) – Action 2.1 (c) for detailed examples of events that had Hate Crime awareness coverage.

**2.6.2** Moving forward BHCA & Bradford Council's Stronger Team, and WYP are working with EDI Lead at Bradford Council and key partners as one system to create clear messaging by pooling resources, energies and expertise to co-design and co-produce a set of **Diversity Calendar programming**. An annual calendar of key significance dates has been established for activities/events for 2023. See **Appendix D** - A series of online awareness and in person events to include Hate Crime awareness will now run annually; BHCA and Stronger Communities are active members on the planning groups to drive Hate Crime awareness, promoting cohesion and integration and feeling safe activities and events as follows:

- Holocaust Memorial Day – January
- LGBTQ+ History Month - February
- Race Equality Week – February
- Safer Internet Day – February
- International Day of Zero Tolerance to FGM – February
- International Women's Day- March
- International Day for the elimination of Racial Discrimination – March
- Transgender Day of Visibility – March
- Stephen Lawrence Day – April

- International Day Against Homophobia, Biphobia and Transphobia – May
- Refugee Week – June
- Windrush Day – June
- Bradford Safeguarding week - June
- Ilkley Pride – July
- Srebrenica Memorial Day – July
- South Asian Heritage Month – July
- Roma Holocaust Memorial Day
- Keighley Pride – August
- National Inclusion Week – September
- International Day of Older Persons – October
- Black History Month – October
- Hate Crime Awareness Week – October
- Islamophobia Awareness Month – November
- World Kindness Day – November
- Interfaith Week – November
- Disability History Month – November
- International Men's Day – November
- Transgender Day of Remembrance – November
- International Day for Elimination of Violence Against Women – December
- Reclaim the Night
- Human Rights Day - December
- International Migrants Day – December

**2.6.3** As part of BHCA's contract, BHCA will be a key partner to help deliver Hate Crime awareness messages and the importance of reporting Hate Crime at the key dates as identified as part of the Diversity Calendar programme.

**2.7** **Recommendation 3 - That the Bradford Hate Co-ordinator continues to work with key partners to develop a software app which seeks to establish easy recording mechanisms, reporting hate incidents in a confidential way and request only the key information of location, time and type; whilst also showing examples of good practice where Hate Crime has been successfully dealt with.**

**2.7.1** BHCA has worked with the University of Bradford and developed software which enables accessible reporting of Hate Crime. The Hate Crime reporting and information web app (Listen Bradford) enables people to report directly from their devices, either to the police or to BHCA. The user testing (soft launch) began in Apr-22; Full launch took place during Hate Crime Awareness week in Oct-22.

**2.7.2** In order to increase downloads of app and increase the number of Hate Crime reporting via the app, further planned work to promote the app includes:

1. Produce coms and marketing materials to ensure people are aware of the new app; conduct a widespread publicity campaign
2. Ongoing awareness training and web app tuition package for reporting centres and community organisations and staff
3. In depth data analysis to understand the impact of the app.

**2.7.3 Target Web App New Users: 1000; Progress: 692.**

**Target Web App Hits: 10,000; Progress: 3132**

Target to increase reporting via app to be agreed for Apr-23 KPIs.

**2.8 Recommendation 4 - That Bradford Council's Hate Crime Co-ordinator, the Police and Victim Support work with Bradford Hate Crime Alliance to deliver refresher training to all individuals at Hate Crime Reporting Centres who are responsible for receiving Hate Crime report and also to develop a refresher programme for regular training, as well as developing a programme of after-care support for individuals who report Hate Crime.**

**2.8.1** The role of the Reporting Centres is to provide a safe place where people can report Hate Crimes. Some people prefer or may feel more comfortable reporting Hate Crime at one of the designated Hate Crime Reporting Centres instead of reporting directly to the Police. It is important that all staff at these reporting centres have the necessary training and experience to deal with the Hate Crime concerns or referrals satisfactorily. The effectiveness of reporting centres is also reliant on the people's knowledge of their existence and them being open. Since 2019, Covid-19 has impacted on Hate Crime reporting significantly. Many of the centres were not open.

**2.8.2** There were 28 Hate Crime Reporting Centres in 2019, spread across the District. The coordination and ongoing support to the independent Hate Crime Reporting Centres is managed by BHCA. Following an audit and the delivery of a training programme held during 2021-22 there are now 22 functioning Reporting Centres. A further 2 new Reporting Centres are soon coming on board: Inspire Academy and Equality Together, supporting Roma communities and people with disabilities.

**2.8.3** Following the audit and training offered to all Hate Crime Reporting Centres, the Centres are now better equipped to respond to Hate Crime concerns, this may help increase reporting at the Centres. The Centres have also been provided with publicity materials and big banners (with QR codes) which is helping publicise that they are a 'Reporting Centre'. Data on reporting at the Reporting Centres will be monitored and evaluated by the Hate Crime Strategic Management Group. Audit Hate Crime Reporting Centres: **Target: 28; Progress 28** audits conducted.

**2.8.4** BHCA has developed an on-going programme to provide training to Hate Crime reporting Centres annually. Management at these Reporting Centres are also required to inform the BHCA when they have staff changes in order that training can be provided to new staff on an 'as and when needed basis'. Hate Crime Unit Refresher Training: **Target: 4; Progress 8** refresher training sessions conducted.

See **Appendix C** – Hate Crime Delivery Plan (Draft) – Action 2.2 & 2.3 for detailed examples of work conducted/ in progress to strengthening the Hate Crime reporting facilities.

**2.9 Recommendation 5 - That the Hate Crime and key partners works towards raising the understanding of Hate Crime across all local communities in the District, by developing a simple, easy to understand explanation of what Hate Crime is and for this to be used in awareness raising materials and campaigns.**

**2.9.1** The Scrutiny Panel Review found that the main contributing factor to the under reporting of Hate Crime, was a lack of understanding amongst individuals and communities in relation to what a Hate Crime is. Highlights of some key work to tackle this include:

1. BHCA have developed a simple and easy to understand explanation of Hate Crime using leaflets and pocket cards to raise awareness, across the following communities / groups: Disability; LGBTQ+; Gypsy Roma; Asian women; Women's group; Faith; communities; African Caribbean and African community; Refugees and asylum seekers; general publics and staff across organisations.
2. Easy Read version to the Hate Crime Strategy published as downloadable resource on the BHCA, Safer Bradford, Bradford Council, Bradford for Everyone websites.
3. New accessible BHCA website and Web App launched Oct-22.
4. Targeted Hate Crime awareness events, activities, training, workshops (adapted for each audience) run throughout the year this includes holding information stalls across the district and speaking for example to large audiences such as at Bradford City Football Club matches during Hate Crime Awareness week; reaching 18k+ people, promoting the District's core campaigns for example: I am listening; Root Out Racism; Bradford District Shared Values; Make Sure It Adds Up; #IAMBradford.

**2.9.2** See **Appendix C** – Hate Crime Delivery Plan (Draft) 1.1 (a) and 2.1 (a, b, c) for detailed work examples on how simple, easy to understand information on Hate Crime has been developed and widely distributed.

**2.10 Recommendation 6 - That Bradford Council's Hate Crime Co-ordinator, the Police, Voluntary Community Sector, Hate Crime Reporting Centres and Bradford Hate Crime Alliance, liaise with Morley Street Resource to develop and deliver a bespoke training session for Disabled groups, aimed at improving their understanding of Hate Crime and also of how they can report Hate Crime incidents**

**2.10.1** As part of BHCA's annual contracted work is to develop and deliver four 'Understanding Disability Hate Crime' training sessions. During 2021-22, **10** disability awareness Hate Crime training sessions were delivered to community interest groups via Zoom with approx., **150** participants reached. The Hate Crime training for 2022-23 is currently on hold as Morley Street is still not fully functioning.

**2.10.2** During 2022 a new Tackling Disability Hate Crime Group has been established (see point 2.12.1 in this report); with core membership which includes: BHCA; Bradford People First; WYP; Stronger Communities; Victim Support; 1x Supported Living Organisation. The aim is for the group to develop its network across the District. The group is currently developing its training offer. This will be co-produced and jointly delivered. A key priority is to work with young people across the district.

**2.11 Recommendation 7 - That material is produced for support workers in the areas of disability, mental health, and sign language and translation services to increase awareness of Hate Crime services.**



- 2.11.1 The easy read version of the Hate Crime Strategy 2021-24 has been published; the new mobile app and new website has been designed so that it can be shared between different users including sign language. See point 2.9.1 in this report.
- 2.11.2 Hate Hurts is the joint campaign of West Yorkshire Police and the West Yorkshire Combined Authority. 'Hate Hurts' publicity materials (posters, leaflets, easy read information for the campaign; materials have been published and printed in various languages.
- 2.11.3 Hate and Mate Crime leaflets in easy read have been produced by the Safeguarding Voice group. In 2023, to work with Voice Group to design up and print these in different formats (paper copies, audio, and sign).

**2.12 Recommendation 8 - That Bradford Council's Hate Crime Co-ordinator works with the Morley Street Resource Centre, in developing a Disability Hate Crime Group, aimed at providing specific and focused Hate Crime training and support to all Disabled groups**

- 2.12.1 BHCA re-established the Tackling Disability Hate Crime Group in 2022, 3 meetings were held. The Partnership and Engagement Officer at Stronger Communities (who is leading on disabilities) will now coordinate this work in partnership with the Hate Crime Co-ordinator at BHCA and Police Hate Crime leads: To plan and host quarterly meetings; coproduce events / training resources/ activities, addressing emerging issues; report on progress to the Hate Crime Strategic Management Group's, feeding into the Hate Crime delivery plan. See 2.10.2 in this report.
- 2.12.2 Hate Crime Strategic Management Group as of 2023, will all connect and work together with Safeguarding Voice, who is the Safeguarding Adults Board's service user group made up of people with care and support needs, carers & advocates. Quarterly meetings are currently running and Hate and Mate Crime is a big part of the group's work; Hate and Mate Crime materials and newsletters have been produced and now the group is working on 'What is a good friend' to tackle mate crime. Voice members attended events / sites to raise awareness on Hate Crime. The Chair of the Voice group is currently also the Bradford for Everyone Ambassador for the Stronger Communities service; a two-way communication has been created so that work is aligned, tapping into each other's assets/resources and avoiding the duplication of work.

**2.13 Recommendation 9 - That Bradford Council's Hate Crime Co-ordinator and Bradford Hate Crime Alliance, facilitate the development of a Multi-Agency Hate Crime Group consisting of key groups and partners, aimed at the sharing of resources, co-ordination of work being undertaken for Hate Crime across the whole of the Bradford District and a more joined up approach to supporting victims of Hate Crime.**

- 2.13.1 **Hate Crime Strategic Management Group (SMG)** – SMG leads the Council's and its partners' approach to addressing Hate Crime across the Bradford District. SMG ensures that the District's Hate Crime Strategy is implemented on a partnership approach with clear delivery plan and aims to work towards:

1. Preventing Hate Crime;
2. Increasing reporting of Hate Crime;
3. Responding to and building an understanding of Hate Crime across communities;
4. Improving support for victims of Hate Crime.

**2.13.2** SMG is a Sub-group of and reports to Community Safety Partnership and is informed by the Stronger Communities Partnership Board. There is reciprocal arrangement in place to ensure these two boards are connected and kept informed in relation to Hate Crime work. SMG's core membership includes:

1. City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council – Neighbourhood and Customer Services to include: Stronger Communities and Prevent;
2. Bradford Hate Crime Alliance;
3. West Yorkshire Police;
4. Victim Support;
5. West Yorkshire Restorative Justice Service.

SMG works in collaboration with: Education Services (includes schools, university and colleges); Housing providers; Safeguarding Adults Board; Children's Safeguarding Board; Health; voluntary community sector organisations and residents/communities.

**2.13.3** Due to the change of staff as explained in 2.2.1 in this report, the work of Hate Crime is now overseen by the Stronger Communities service at the Council. The Partnerships and Engagement Manager leads on the Hate Crime work for the local authority and Chairs the SMG. This transition meant the work of SMG was on hold for a few months; however, the work to deliver the actions within Hate Crime Strategy continued. SMG reconvened in Sept-22; Terms of Reference for the group have been reviewed and the Hate Crime Delivery Plan has been published. SMG meets on a quarterly basis.

**Target: 4; Progress: 2** SMG meetings held.

See **Appendix E – Hate Crime Strategic Management Group – Terms of Reference (Draft)**

**2.13.4** SMG's work in pipeline will include the voices of key groups with Protected Characteristics. The five Stronger Communities Partnership & Engagement Officers will be joining and or setting up groups/networks made up from people with Protected Characteristics/Communities of Interest groups; each Officer is championing specific Protected Characteristics work. The Officers will then provide quarterly updates on which groups are being engaged; provide data on reach and content covered. Issues in relation to Hate Crimes flagged here will then be addressed accordingly with key partners to give people, organisations and victims the support they need. This will create a shared understanding on needs and gaps in relation to driving Hate Crime work.

**2.13.5 Case Management Meetings** have been created to have a co-ordinated approach to addressing Hate Crime. BHCA, WYP, Victim Support and Restorative Justice run case management meetings to discuss relevant cases / encourage victims to come forward and offer support. **Target: 4 Progress 7** meetings held.

**2.13.6 Hate Crime Scrutiny Panels** are led by the police for communities; at the panels cases are scored on how well the police handled each case. **Target: 4** Hate Crime Scrutiny panels to run annually; **Progress: 3** panels have taken place.

**2.14 Recommendation 10 - That Bradford Council works with its key partners with a view to developing a programme of sharing best practice and resources, to target and address Hate Crime more effectively across the District**

**2.14.1** Bradford Council, BHCA and WYP continues to work with many key partners across programmes, projects, boards, networks and events locally, regionally, nationally and globally. We have a learning culture, working with researchers to make sure our information is correct and that we learn from it so that we can plan future projects and programmes well. Some work highlights include:

1. Continuing to **share learnings** about Hate Crime, what works and what doesn't work in many different formats such: through presentation delivery; talks at events and on radio, making films; on socials; publishing briefings, reports and sharing with partner organisations and across the Wellbeing Board, Stronger Communities Partnership Board and Safer Communities Partnership.
2. **Government Events:** Presented at the Hate Crime Conference: Working in Partnership to Support Victims and Tackle Perpetrators in Nov-22 attended by **52** people.
3. Bradford remains a key and active member of the Council of Europe's **Intercultural Cities Network (ICC)** where as one of 156 cities around the world we learn, share and collaborate on how cities can become more 'intercultural' in both policy and practice. In Jun-22 Bradford was represented in person at the first ever Committee of Experts on the Intercultural Integration of migrants (ADI-INT) at the Council of Europe in Strasbourg. This work continues.
4. Bradford is a member of **Belong** - "The cohesion and Integration Network" – the Stronger Communities team spoke at the annual conference – entitled "Belonging" –highlighting Bradford's innovative projects. This work continues.
5. Member of **Peoples Powerhouse Racial Justice Network** - amplifying the voices of northern communities, ensuring that decision makers are held to account to make social inclusion, economic inclusion, and racial equality a reality. This work continues.

**2.14.2** Work in pipeline

1. To review the recommendations from the University of Bradford's Social Integration Research: 'One Bradford, Many Voices' findings
2. To be involved in the **Diversity Exchange** - web-based portal which will share intelligence, resources, information and insight relating to equality, diversity and inclusion as well as the network.

## **2.15 Recommendation 11 - That Bradford Council's Hate Crime Co-coordinator explores possible funding streams, to carry out Hate Crime work, including but not limited to, awareness raising, preventative work and support activities**

**2.15.1** The Hate Crime Strategic Management Group collectively aims to maximise the benefits of different funding streams and continues to explore new ways of obtaining funds. Below are some examples of funding that has been successfully obtained and contributed to Hate Crime work, raising awareness, improving togetherness, cohesion, integration and helping people and communities feeling safe:

### **2.15.2 Bradford Hate Crime Alliance**

BHCA has been successful in obtaining further funding which has allowed the following work to be undertaken:

1. **'Let's Talk About It' project** was a 10-week programme covering topics on racism, white supremacy, and where prejudice and unconscious bias come from with an emphasis on personal reflection and open honest discussions. Further funding streams will be explored to run this again.
2. The production and running of the Listen Bradford **Web App**
3. The refresh of the **Bradfordhatecrimealliance.com** website.
4. Prints of **Hate Crime Banners** for all reporting centres
5. Working with **Equality Together**; support was provided to enable the establishment of the Equality Together group, this has led to the re-establishment of a group to focus on Hate Crime directed towards people with disabilities particularly those with learning disability.
6. **Bespoke Training** programme delivered at a secondary inner-city school as highlighted in point 2.16.1 in this report (this was born from increased demand for training).

### **2.15.3 West Yorkshire Police**

Bradford's WYP's team have invested in staff resources, see 2.2.3 in this report; Hate Crime referrals are managed as well as delivering training, projects and activities to raise awareness on Hate Crime. Funding streams allow the following projects/ work to run:

1. During 2022 Home Office funded project allowed the delivery of a programme of events around self-defence which included Hate Crime Awareness; staying and feeling safe. 3 sessions held in Nov-22: 1 at a Mosque, 1 at a Sikh Temple and 1 Hindu temple. Led by WYP Women's Engagement and Faith Engagement Officers; Exploring further funding opportunities to expand this.
2. An annual contribution is made to support Hate Crime Awareness Week
3. In early Feb-23 the Chief Constable agreed to uplift the number of Hate Crime Co-ordinators from 2 across Bradford District to a total of 5. This is a significant investment and will help further support victims of Hate Crime; enhancing partnership working and community engagement capabilities. The 3 new officers will join the team in 2023.

**2.15.4 Bradford Council - Bradford for Everyone Programme** was funded by the Department for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities and worked across four key areas: **Getting On:** Address factors affecting economic participation and language skills; **Getting Along:** Promote greater interaction, dialogue and understanding between people from different backgrounds; ensuring that people understand fully their rights and freedoms and their responsibilities; **Getting Involved:** Generating and connecting people to opportunities to participate in community and civic life and strengthening leadership; **Feeling Safe:** Tackling Hate Crime and the fear of Hate Crime so that everyone feels safe.

The Bradford for Everyone programme delivered a total of 85 projects, engaging 36,000+ people across the Bradford District. These projects have ranged from small scale projects bringing children of different ethnic, religious or socio-economic backgrounds together through the medium of collective game design, to a large-scale systemic pieces of work which is enabling employers to become truly 'inclusive'. Between 2019-22, the following Hate Crime / Feeling Safe work and projects were undertaken (some highlights):

1. **Faith in our Communities** project promoted dialogue and understanding between the leaders and congregations of places of worship and LGBTQ+ communities.
2. **Great Horton Ambassadors** project focussed to improve relations between the Roma and non-Roma communities in Great Horton. The project addressed marginalisation and low aspirations through collaborative involvement in locally based social action projects.
3. **The Sharakat Project** - Talking for Change provided a safe space for people from different backgrounds and cultures to meet, to develop friendships and understanding. Learning about each other's differences but also finding that they have 'more in common'.
4. **African Study for Change** project was based on Hate Crime and discrimination directed towards black people. Further funding streams will be explored to run this again.
5. **Piloting Community Cohesion** a series of activities that promoted greater interaction, dialogue and understanding between people of different backgrounds. The project targeted young people, women from black minority, ethnic groups, refugees and white working class communities.
6. **Great Horton Common Ground Project** tested a new and collaborative approach to addressing community tensions and poor social mixing in Great Horton.
7. **Con-Fession - BFD** creative sessions ran to raise awareness of Hate Crime to young people to help them understand the consequences of this on other people, seek alternative ways of thinking about the problem and solutions.
8. **Youth in Common** - young people from different communities were brought together to undertake thematic bite size workshops and recreational / social activities to better understand each other's sense of 'identity/ belonging', cultural and religious values and beliefs to dispel myths and prejudice, engender mutual respect and tolerance and enable them to realise we have more in common which unites us than the differences that separate us.
9. **Free2B-Me Community Garden** set up of Free2Be-ME's community garden project to provide a sanctuary for people from the LGBTQ+ community;

utilising a shared community garden as a means of bringing people together from different backgrounds, cultures, abilities and ages – creating shared ownership, shared interests and shared goals which help forge relationships between groups some of whom have previously experienced difficulties in understanding each other's perspectives. This project continues.

10. **Move on Up and Participate - Bradford East Africa Community** project delivered cultural orientation sessions to refugee and migrant communities addressing widely distorted and anti-immigration views regarding refugee and asylum seekers in our society and pessimism about their future opportunity and ensure our city which is ethnically and racially diverse society create opportunities for productive social mixing that celebrate diversity and help reduce discrimination / hate; enable East Africa communities to settle, and feel safe.
11. **Young Peacemakers** was a 20 weeks' peace education programme for young people (8-15 Years old), aiming to inspire and empower changemaking and peacemaking skills to act and change themselves, families, communities, and the world. The programme explored concepts such as peace, justice, equality, human rights, democracy, global citizenship, conflict-resolution and reconciliation, as well as the serious of challenges of climate change, Black lives matter, poverty, refugee crises, war, colonialism, Islamophobia, terrorism, xenophobia, racism, violence against women, and bullying
12. **Friends of Bradford Moor Park Project** the project brought together communities and individuals from all walks of life and backgrounds - promoting interaction, dialogue and understanding between them.
13. **Bradford for Everyone Ambassador Programme** (resident led) ran sessions discussing topics including Black Lives Matter, the diversity of white people, the diversity of the LGBTQ+ communities and supported the delivery of activities and events such as refugee week, Hate Crime week, International Women's Day, Migration Day. Aim to increase understanding within these areas and reduce Hate Crime. The work of the Ambassador programme continues
14. **Community Champions** training was delivered in partnership with Bradford for Everyone and the Prevent team on critical thinking. Bradford for Everyone worked in partnership with Race Equality Network, Equality Together and Community Action Bradford and District to reduce inequality and support for Black, Asian and Ethnic Minority communities and those with a disability.
15. **Social Integration Research: 'One Bradford, Many Voices'** - University of Bradford undertook an 18-month programme of research to explore how people connect and integrate, contributing to the body of knowledge that will help to create a better future for the Bradford District and beyond, with the aims of: Understanding the dynamics of residential segregation; Facilitating the reduction of Hate Crime; Identifying strategies for and good practice in relation to integration in schools. The Hate Crime research aimed to better understand how people across the District feel about Hate Crime, what it means, what, where and how to report, public's confidence in the reporting system, how they feel about support for Hate Crime victims and also to obtain their opinion on what could and should be improved. The research was published in Aug-22. The recommendations will be reviewed in Mar-23.
16. **Social Trust Project** - collaboration work between the Council of Europe and the Social Trust Collaboratory in Canada. Both understood the

importance of social trust to a multitude of outcomes for places and communities including health, cohesion, crime and economic and felt the need to be able to measure, map, and act upon, indications of social trust at the neighbourhood level. As an active Intercultural Cities member and leader in integration and cohesion work Bradford was asked to become a pilot district for the development of a Social Trust Barometer tool and a core team from Stronger Communities has been working with the Social Trust Collaborated on the development and roll-out of this project during the past two years. The Social Trust Project aims to measure social trust at the local level, develop a Social Sensing Network of professionals who know places well and can act within them, and to utilise knowledge about trust levels and positive deviance (what's working) in particular places, to develop interventions or policy to support places suffering lower – or declining – levels of social trust – helping to create a safer and more equal district. This pilot continues.

17. **Campaign 1:** Worked with a behaviour change specialist, launched a critical thinking campaign called 'Make Sure It Adds Up' to reduce hate towards people from LGBTQ+, Muslim, Migrant and Working Class communities. This campaign continues.
18. **Campaign 2:** Launched Bradford District's 'Shared Values' of: Respect, Share, Care, Protect; this is a positive social modelling campaign and introduced as a long term drive to stimulate community dialogue, encourage attitudinal change and halt all forms of discrimination to build a fair, inclusive and happy future for everyone. This campaign continues.
19. **People Library** was launched, highlighting real life stories and offering human books related to diverse groups and raising awareness of Hate Crime and its impact. Project continues.

**2.15.5** Bradford Council has allocated a recurring investment to build a 'Stronger Communities Team' transitioning the work of the Bradford for Everyone Programme in to a base budget response. Each Partnership and Engagement Officer has been assigned to work alongside each area office aligning to locality working (Bradford South, East, West, Shipley and Keighley) and coordinate work, activities and action plans which support the work of communities of interest / protected characteristics, championing equality, diversity and inclusion across the district.

**2.15.6** Prevent has submitted a bid to the Home Office for 2023-24. The bid focusses on running projects on critical thinking and online misogyny. Critical Thinking training has been delivered in the past, if this bid is successful then this work can continue. Currently awaiting the results of the bid.

**2.16 Recommendation 12 - That Bradford Council's Hate Crime Co-ordinator and key partners work with schools to encourage training and development, where resources allow, of Hate Crime to support both staff and pupils to raise awareness and knowledge.**

**2.16.1** Some key highlights of work with schools and young people include:

1. Hate crime awareness training delivery in schools and colleges ongoing;  
**Target 8: Progress: 34** sessions delivered.
2. Completed an extensive bespoke project at a secondary inner city school

including workshops delivered to the **whole school** on Hate Crime; for every form group & year group (year 7 to 13). Plus, CPD training rolled out for teachers 'Empowering Teachers to Tackle Hate'.

3. Ran **2** workshops at Bradford College's 14-16 provision
4. Continue to involve Schools in key dates and events for example the Holocaust Memorial Debate held at the Council Chambers was between 3 schools; a total of **40** children attended with **6** people on the panel to answer questions put forward by young people. The session was recorded for BCB.
5. Connect and support the Pol-ED (WYP) team on the education programme (Y1-13), written by teachers for teachers to keep children safe; content includes Hate Crime, bullying & harassment, we will help promote this.
6. Bradford District Schools Linking Network continues (designed to provide preventative factors against Hate Crime); **142** classes from **74** schools (2022 to Jan-23) engaged. The Intergenerational Linking has had **42** Links with older people's groups and care homes across the district.
7. Work with Prevent Education Officer to distribute Hate Crime resources around education establishments.

**2.17 Recommendation 13 - Bradford Council's Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee to receive a report back in 12 months, which monitors the progress against all the recommendations contained within this scrutiny review**

**2.17.1** On 8<sup>th</sup> Dec-22 a progress update to the recommendations from the findings from the Hate Crime Scrutiny Review was presented at the Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee. A more detailed response to meet the actions identified with specific measures was requested back at Overview & Scrutiny committee in three months' time, on 9 Mar-23.

**2.18 Recommendation 14 - The use of social media be considered, to show examples of good practice where Hate Crime has been successfully dealt with.**

**2.18.1** The delivery of Hate Crime work recognises the importance of good digital hubs and social media as a means to connect people, to share positive stories, ideas and expand opportunities for learning and see what's going on. All teams actively use socials to share examples of good work that is happening across the district, highlighting Hate Crime related activities, events and national campaign's such as Hate Crime Awareness Week (HCAW), Islamophobia Awareness Month (#IAMBradford), Race Equality Week, etc. The Calendar of key events helps plan this work; see **Appendix D** – Calendar of key events. Some highlights include:

1. The new BHCA web page is interactive, having informative and educational materials as well as showcasing films, and a series of podcasts. For example, the landing page of the website shares a positive film of two sisters who and how change is empowered through restorative justice.
2. The Stronger Communities' Bradford for Everyone website is full of news, information on what works, stories of lived experiences (People Library, Shared Values).



## 2.18.2 Data on digital hubs and social media includes:

1. **@BHCA\_UK** - BHCA's **Twitter** has 300 followers. Total Impressions for (9 months): 34,187, New Followers 85 new followers (9 months) **Facebook** since it's relaunch, the Facebook page continues to grow and in the last quarter reached 1580 people. Work is in progress to build on an **Instagram** page. Since its launch of the new **Website** (Oct-22); 355 New Users and 3,296 page views across the webpage; Newly active on YouTube.
2. **@BfdForEveryone** - Stronger Communities' Bradford for Everyone web and social media summary stats (Jan-Dec-22) include: **Website**: Page views 18,221; Unique page views 15,684; **Twitter**: Average Impressions per month 81,000; Followers 2,900; New Followers per month 56; **Facebook**: Page Reach 106,235 (Up 360%); New Page followers 178 (Up 29%); Page & Profile Visits 1,133 (Up 32.1%); **Instagram**: Instagram Reach: 23,884 (Up 1300%); Followers 1134; New Followers: 260. Active on YouTube **YouTube** Video Views 4873; Impressions 68,930; Top Videos *Bradford for Everyone: The Movie* with 1107 views; *Shared Values* with 1009 views; *Wrestler, Fireman, Rocking Horse Maker* (People Library) with 638 views.
3. **@WYP\_SaferBD** - WYP BD Stronger Team's **Twitter** has 750 followers; Average Impressions per month 25,127. Average New Followers per month 13.

See **Appendix C** – Hate Crime Delivery Plan (Draft) for more detailed work examples across all recommendations.

## 3. OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

The work of tackling Hate Crime ensures that Hate Crime is also built into the delivery of the following strategies and action plans.

1. Community Safety Plan;
2. Stronger Communities Strategy;
3. Roma Strategy;
4. City & Local Authority of Sanctuary Action Plan.

The Safer and Stronger Teams lead on delivering this work, which helps build on integration, cohesion and feeling safe outcomes.

## 4. FINANCIAL & RESOURCE APPRAISAL

- 4.1 Community Safety Partnership provides a sum from the West Yorkshire Combined Authority's funding to BHCA to undertake an agreed level of Hate Crime work across the District. The current contract is for the value of £55,000. This does not have a direct effect on the Council's mainstream funding.
- 4.2 The Community Co-ordinator, role funded by the Home Office, was the Council's Hate Crime Lead, however the Home Office funding ceased as of Mar-22. From Apr-22 the responsibility for delivering Hate Crime work is now managed by the Stronger Communities service at Bradford Council.

**4.3** As a look back there has been a huge amount of work taking place to address Hate Crime in Bradford District, as illustrated within the report, historically and to date. With vast majority of this work being led by BHCA with a relatively small grant from the Community Safety Partnership (which is not Council base budget). The recent development of the Stronger Team within the Council and now within the Police Hate Crime team, BHCA will be supported well to build on this good work going forward.

## **5. RISK MANAGEMENT AND GOVERNANCE ISSUES**

**5.1** The Community Safety Partnership and Stronger Communities Partnership Boards report to the Wellbeing Board governance arrangements.

**5.2** Risks likely to cause community tensions are monitored and mitigating actions are put in place through the Community Safety Partnership structure.

## **6. LEGAL APPRAISAL**

There are no legal implications

## **7. OTHER IMPLICATIONS**

### **7.1 Equality Objectives**

**7.1.1** The District's response and work to tackle and prevent Hate Crime contributes to all four of the Council's Equality Objectives:

1. **Visibility, leadership and accountability** - instilling zero tolerance for discriminatory behaviour and any type of abuse, mistreatment or wrongdoing
2. **Workforce** – working together to champion equality, diversity and inclusion at all levels, within every workforce, organisation and setting
3. **Community** - working with our residents and communities as equal partners so that they can be our voice and influence
4. **Services** - ensuring that everything we do is accessible, inclusive and responsive to the needs of our people

**7.1.2** All grant funded, contracted partners, projects and work in relation to Hate Crime recognises the single statutory duty to promote equality under the Equality Act 2010. All our work and the work of our partners ensures and demonstrates that all services and work has due regard to:

1. eliminate unlawful discrimination, harassment and victimisation and other conduct that is prohibited by or under the Equality Act 2010
2. advance equality of opportunity between persons who share a relevant protected characteristic and persons who do not share it
3. foster good relations between people who share a relevant protected characteristic and persons who do not share it.

**7.1.3** The Hate Crime Strategic Management Group has committed to the Bradford District's Shared Values of Respect, Care, Share, Protect. By working and living by our Shared Values, and this has been built into the group's Terms of Reference. **See Appendix E**

## **7.2 SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS**

There are no sustainability implications

## **7.3 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS IMPACTS**

There are no impacts on greenhouse gas admissions

## **7.4 COMMUNITY SAFETY IMPLICATIONS**

The actions outlined in this report improve Hate Crime awareness and reporting leading to improved community safety outcomes.

## **7.5 HUMAN RIGHTS ACT**

There are no Human Rights Act implications, however, the work of Hate Crime contributes positively to the many articles within the Human Rights Act.

## **7.6 TRADE UNION**

There are no trade union implications.

## **7.7 WARD IMPLICATIONS**

There are no ward implications.

## **7.8 AREA COMMITTEE ACTION PLAN IMPLICATIONS**

(for reports to Area Committees only)

None

## **7.9 IMPLICATIONS FOR CHILDREN AND YOUNG PEOPLE**

None

## **7.10 ISSUES ARISING FROM PRIVACY IMPACT ASSESMENT**

None

## **8. NOT FOR PUBLICATION DOCUMENTS**

None

## **9. OPTIONS**

- 9.1** The Overview & Scrutiny Committee to make further recommendations should they be needed to improve the current working model and progress made to tackle Hate Crime in Bradford District.

## **10. RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 10.1** The Overview & Scrutiny Committee to note the progress made on the District's Hate Crime work by Bradford Council, BHCA and West Yorkshire Police and partners in meeting the recommendations identified in the Hate Crime Scrutiny Review.

## **11. APPENDICES**

**11.1 Appendix A** – Hate Crime Scrutiny Review Tuesday 23 March 2021

**11.2 Appendix B** – Hate Crime Strategy

**11.3 Appendix C** – Hate Crime Delivery Plan (Draft)

**11.4 Appendix D** – Calendar of key events programme

**11.5 Appendix E** – Hate Crime Strategic Management Group Terms of Reference (Draft)

## **12. BACKGROUND DOCUMENTS**

- 12.1** Bradford for Everyone Strategy  
<https://bradfordforeveryone.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2021/11/Bradford-for-Everyone-Strategy-2018-2023.pdf>
- 12.2** Bradford for Everyone Programme Evaluation Report  
<https://bradfordforeveryone.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2022/08/Bradford-for-Everyone-Programme-Evaluation-Report.pdf>
- 12.3** The Linking Network Evaluation Report  
<https://bradfordforeveryone.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2022/07/The-Linking-Network-Evaluation-2019-2022.pdf>
- 12.4** Bradford District Shared Values Campaign  
<https://bradfordforeveryone.co.uk/bradford-district-shared-values/>
- 12.5** Make Sure It Adds Up campaign  
<https://bradfordforeveryone.co.uk/make-sure-it-adds-up/>
- 12.6** Roma Strategy  
<https://bradfordforeveryone.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Roma-Strategy-2021-2025.pdf>
- 12.7** Community Safety Plan  
<https://bradford.moderngov.co.uk/documents/s36026/CorpOS9DecDocUAppendix%20One.pdf>
- 12.8** City & Local Authority of Sanctuary  
<https://bradfordforeveryone.co.uk/bradford-council-has-been-awarded-the-status-of-local-authority-of-sanctuary/>
- 12.9** Social Integration Research Summary Report: 'One Bradford, Many Voices'  
<https://bradfordforeveryone.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2023/02/Social-Integration-Research-Summary-Report.pdf>
- 12.10** Social Integration Research – Full Report: 'One Bradford, Many Voices'  
<https://bradfordforeveryone.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2023/02/Social-Integration-Research-Full-Report.pdf>